

Accreditation Report

Armenian National Agrarian University (Eriwan, Armenia)

Agricultural Management (M.Sc.)

I Procedure

Date of contract: 19 January 2022

Date of the submission of self-assessment report: 2 August 2022

Date of site visit: 21. September 2022

Attendance by ACQUIN office: Dr. Jasmine Rudolph

Accreditation decision: 9 Mai 2023

Peer review experts:

- **Prof. Dr. Elena Kashtanova**, Anhalt University of Applied Sciences, Professor of International Trade in Agribusiness
- **FH-Prof. MMag. Dr. Michael Schmidthaler**, Upper Austria University of Applied Sciences, Professor and Head of study programme Agricultural Management and Innovations
- **Prof. Dr. Thore Toews**, Technical University Bingen, Professor for applied agricultural business management, agricultural accounting and taxation, taxation theory, agricultural business planning and controlling
- **Farhod Ahrorov**, PhD, Vice-Rector Samarkand branch of Tashkent State University of Economics (Uzbekistan)
- **Dr. Alen Mujcinovic**, Associate Professor, Faculty of Agriculture and Food Sciences University of Sarajevo Sarajevo (Bosnia and Herzegovina)
- **Professor Anargul Belgibayeva**, Sh. Ualikhanov Kokshetau University, Department of Business and Services
- **Marat Onaev**, Zhangir Khan University (Uralsk, Kazakhstan), Director of the Institute of Agrotechnology

- **Rinat Fazylbekov**, Deputy Head, Department of technology innovation Kazakh Research Institute of Plant, Protection and Quarantine
- **Professor Dr. Aleksandra Mandych**, State Biotechnological University, (Kharkiv, Ukraine), Economics and Management of Enterprise
- **Professor Dr. Volodymyr Pysarenko**, Poltava State Agrarian University (Poltava, Ukraine), Head of marketing department
- **Professor Valentina Yakubiv**, Vasyl Stefanyk Precarpathian National University, Vice-Rector for Research, Department of Business Administration
- **Alina Magomedova**, PhD, Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv, Associate Professor, Department of Business Economics
- **Nurgaziev Mairambek**, PhD, Associate Professor, American University of Central Asia, Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan
- **Ulrich Pingel**, CEO, Agralis GmbH
- **Sandra Koop**, University Kiel, Student of Agricultural Sciences (M.Sc.)

The **Assessment Report** of the peer-review experts is **based on** the self-assessment report of the Higher Education Institution (HEI) and extensive discussions with the HEI management, deans and/or heads of the departments, heads of study programme, lecturers, staff representatives, students, and alumni.

The basis of the **Assessment Criteria** is part 1 of the “Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area” (ESG) in the current official version. At the same time the national context, particularly the national regulations regarding the establishment of study programmes, are taken into account.

Content

I	Procedure	1
II	Introduction	6
1	Short profile of HEI	6
2	General information on the study programme	8
3	Results of the previous accreditation	8
4	ESG Standard 1.1: Policy for quality assurance	9
4.1	Implementation	9
4.2	Assessment	10
4.3	Conclusion	11
5	ESG Standard 1.2: Design and approval of programmes	11
5.1	Implementation	11
5.2	Assessment	13
5.3	Conclusion	14
6	ESG Standard 1.3: Student-centred learning, teaching, and assessment	14
6.1	Implementation	14
6.2	Assessment	17
6.3	Conclusion	19
7	ESG Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition, and certification	19
7.1	Implementation	19
7.2	Assessment	21
7.3	Conclusion	21
8	ESG Standard 1.5: Teaching staff	21
8.1	Implementation	22
8.2	Assessment	22
8.3	Conclusion	24
9	ESG Standard 1.6: Learning resources and student support	24
9.1	Implementation	24
9.2	Assessment	25
9.3	Conclusion	26
10	ESG Standard 1.7: Information management	26
10.1	Implementation	26
10.2	Assessment	27
10.3	Conclusion	28
11	ESG Standard 1.8: Public information	28
11.1	Implementation	28
11.2	Assessment	29
11.3	Conclusion	30
12	ESG Standard 1.9: On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes	30
12.1	Implementation	30
12.2	Assessment	31

12.3	Conclusion	33
13	ESG Standard 1.10: Cyclical external quality assurance	33
13.1	Implementation	33
13.2	Assessment	34
13.3	Conclusion	35
III	Recommendation to the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN	36
1	Assessment of compliance the Standards and Guidelines in the Higher European Area (ESG) in the actual official version	36
2	Accreditation Recommendation	38
IV	Decisions of the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN	40

II Introduction

The experts would like to thank the representatives of the HEI as well as students that they have taken part in the discussions and willingly shared information and their views during the site visit. The discussions are valuable not only for the assessment of the institution, but also for a better understanding of the legal and sociocultural context of the local higher education system.

Evaluation basis for the peer-review experts is the self-assessment report of the HEI as well as intensive discussions during the site visit with the HEI management, deans and/or heads of the departments, head(s) of the study programme(s), study programme(s) coordinators, teachers, lecturers, administrative staff, students, and graduates.

Main objective of the accreditation procedure is to assess the quality of the study programmes and compliance with the "Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area" (ESG). The ESG standards are applied as main assessment criteria in the international accreditation procedure.

In addition, the respective country-specific criteria and standards are taken into account.

A group of experts was set up, which ensured that all areas relevant to the accreditation procedure (e.g. legal, structural, social etc. aspects) as well as the ESG and national criteria were considered. The peer-review experts include professors, representatives of the professional practice and the student representative. A certificate with the ACQUIN seal is awarded upon accreditation of the study programme.

1 Short profile of HEI

Armenian National Agrarian University is one of the largest universities in Armenia and the only higher education institution in the agrarian sphere . It was formed as an Armenian Agricultural Academy in 1994 (upon the RA Government Decree, July 7, 1994) in the result of unification of Armenian Agri-cultural and Yerevan Zoo-Veterinary Institutes, which, since the date of their establishment (1930), had been of paramount significance for the development of agrarian sector in Armenia, as well as for pre-paring high-quality specialists and implementing various research activities in the former Soviet Union countries. By the RA Government Decree N° 1597, September 15, 2005, the university was renamed as Armenian State Agrarian University and later on, upon the Decree N° 872, July 14, 2012 it was changed into Armenian National Agrarian University. Per the RA Government Program, agriculture has been set as a priority in the economic development. Since 2018, the University has entered the active period of reforms. The role of ANAU in the agricultural sector

boosted up, particularly in the result of structural changes in the RA Government, when the Ministry of Agriculture was dissolved and ANAU, being conscious of its superiority in the agricultural sector, took over national priorities as a reform base and started its activities in favour of their realization and UN Sustainable Development Goals implementation. With its new strategy of 2020-2024 ANAU announced about its rebranding and being faced with the challenges of 4th industrial revolution and agriculture 4.0, positioned itself as an agri-technological university. Currently, the University is at the stage of intensive evolution; radical changes in line with the vision of becoming an agri-technological university are being applied in the study programs, new laboratories are being established, teaching-experimental farms are being reequipped and the activities of ANAU research centers have considerably improved.

The scope of teaching and educational courses of the University is covered by the lyceum, college, bachelor, master and postgraduate programmes and by those of Agribusiness Teaching Center. The university has branches in Sisian, Vanadzor and Gyumri, where ANAU branches also conduct their educational activities. There are 3 teaching-experimental farms, 3 scientific research institutes, 5 scientific research centers and 3 scientific branches in the University structure.

As of 2022, the university has 3252 students, 473 lecturers, 36 of which are experienced professors and doctors, 241 - candidates of sciences and 107 are administrative employees.

2 General information on the study programme

Location	Armenian National Agrarian University: Master study programme in Agricultural Management (M.Sc.)
Date of introduction	01.09.2003
Faculty/ department	Faculty of Agribusiness and Economics
Standard period of study (semesters)	4 semesters / trimester, 2 years
Number of ECTS credits	120
Number of study places	6-8 p.a.
Number of students currently enrolled	6 per semester, 6 per year
Average number of graduates per year	5
Form of study	Full-Time

3 Results of the previous accreditation

The study programme "**Master study programme in Agricultural Management (M.Sc.)**" was examined and accredited by the ACQUIN for the first time in 2016 resulting in the following condition:

- In order to ensure the standard of theses at Master's level, the university must university must draw up a handbook for students that defines minimum requirements and standards for Master's theses are defined.

The conditions were fulfilled. The accreditation was issued by 30 September 2021.

For further development of the study programme, the following recommendations were formulated:

Recommendations:

- Training in the methods of scientific work should be strengthened.
- Students should be guided more strongly towards independent scientific work.
- To this end, course scripts should be supplemented with more current literature and students should be and students should be encouraged to conduct independent literature research.

- The module descriptions should be revised. The topicality of the literature references should be and competences should be checked to see whether they correspond to a master's level.
- The university should examine the possibility of offering forms of examination (e.g. portfolio examinations) that assess performance during the course of study. In this context, leeway in the design of examinations that are permitted by the provisions of Land higher education law allow.
- More use should be made of the variety of possible forms of examinations, in particular more oral module examinations should be offered, insofar as this is possible with regard to competence orientation possible.

A temporary accreditation was issued for the proper implementation of the ACQUIN reaccreditation procedure. The application was approved and the temporary accreditation of the study programme was issued until 30. September 2023.

4 ESG Standard 1.1: Policy for quality assurance

Institutions should have a policy for quality assurance that is made public and forms part of their strategic management. Internal stakeholders should develop and implement this policy through appropriate structures and processes, while involving external stakeholders.

4.1 Implementation

Quality assurance system has been introduced in the university since 2009. In 2011, “Educational Reforms, Strategic Planning, Quality Control and Quality Assurance” division was established, which was reformed into the division of “Educational Reforms, Strategic Planning and Innovative Technologies” in 2016. Upon the decision made on the university structural changes at the session of ANAU board of trustees held on November 6, 2018, ANAU “Quality Assessment and Assurance Centre (QAA)” was established. Starting from the day of its establishment, the objective of culture formation for educational quality assurance became the work impetus in the internal quality control structures of ANAU, which is in line with the European Standards and Guides for quality assurance upon “Institutional and Program Accreditation Principles and Criteria” approved by the RA Government Decree N 959, adopted on June 30, 2011.

QAA center has a developed policy and procedures, which are described on the university website and are available to the internal and external stakeholders. The policy of the QAA center is aimed at the monitoring of ANAU 2020-2024 strategy implementation. The center has mechanisms and tools to monitor the strategy implementation process and to assess it through

Key Assessment Indicators (KAIs). The QAA center is obliged to provide clear, measurable and reliable information to the external evaluators. Currently, the university is in the process of creating an internal quality assurance network system which will aim to enhance the responsibility of each subdivision for internal quality assurance, to form quality assurance culture and to increase the responsibility of each study program management (SPM) team.

“Agricultural Management” (M.Sc.) SPM team plans all activities in conformity with the Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences. There are different monitoring and assessment mechanisms. At ANAU the study process is assessed through the following mechanisms: assessment of the teacher/lecturer by the students (organized by QA center), auditing classes (auditing is conducted by the chairs, monitoring is implemented by the QA center), self-analysis of the study programs (carried out by chairs of the departments), assessment of graduates and employers satisfaction level with study program (implemented by the ANAU Career Development and Lifelong Learning Division), etc.

The teaching course assessment is implemented just by the lecturers. The assessment can be orally or in a written form, nevertheless, irrespective of the selected method, the assessments are implemented with the same criteria after completion of the module. Assessment discloses the strengths and weaknesses of the study process. The results are discussed with the students and serve as a background for conceptual and didactic changes..

4.2 Assessment

The analysis of the internal quality assurance of the programme has shown that the procedures for the development, approval, periodic review and monitoring of the Master's programme "Agricultural Management" (M.Sc.) are carried out in accordance with the study regulations, which indicates that the initiation, development, approval, monitoring, revision and termination of the Master's programme at the University are carried out transparently and in accordance with the approved procedures, in line with the general objectives of the University's development strategy, as well as the students of education participate in the design and improvement of the Master's programme, the evaluation of its components and the quality of teaching.

The quality assurance system for the educational process consists of an internal quality assurance system (administration, department for quality assurance of education, pedagogical and methodological centre for the organisation of the educational process) and external quality assurance.

During the meeting with the representatives of the University it was noted and confirmed that the University has a clear quality culture that ensures systematic development of the educational programme. The University has an Education Quality Assurance Department, whose

main purpose is to monitor educational activities and evaluate the data of academic activities in order to effectively manage the quality of the educational process.

During the accreditation process, it was noted that the results of external quality assurance of higher education are presented in detail on the University's website, especially the comments and suggestions made during previous accreditations on the official website of the University.

In the accreditation process, it is clear that employers are constantly involved in the process of periodic revision of the educational programme. The university has consultation and advisory bodies, as well as an expert council of employers and graduates.

During the meeting with the representatives of the University, the question about the students' specific suggestions on the education programme was not fully answered.

It is therefore recommended that students be more involved in the work of the department in order to take their wishes and suggestions into account when planning and implementing the educational process, selecting, reviewing and updating the educational programme.

4.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

5 ESG Standard 1.2: Design and approval of programmes

Institutions should have processes for the design and approval of their programmes. The programmes should be designed so that they meet the objectives set for them, including the intended learning outcomes. The qualification resulting from a programme should be clearly specified and communicated, and refer to the correct level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, to the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.

5.1 Implementation

ANAU developed “ANAU educational programs development, approval, monitoring and improvement procedure”, based on which all study programs are developed and updated. In addition to this regulation, the management team of the international master’s program “Agraricultural Management” has developed a “Guideline on the Agraricultural Management International Program”.

Study programs are in line with the ANAU mission and vision, as well as with the goals of 2020-2024 strategic plan, particularly with the first 3 objectives of education, research and management.

The program outcomes are aimed to form the competences relevant for undertaking activities in the applied agricultural management sector. Therefore, the alumni of the program are able

to cooperate with well-known foreign universities and international companies. The study program contributes to the internationalization of the university education as stated in the priorities of the ANAU strategy, to the enhancement of ANAU reputation and promotes improvement of educational and applied research quality, as well as diversity. In Armenia, agriculture is a priority area of the economy. It makes 12.0 % of the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) of Armenia and 21.8 % of the total labor are engaged in this area. Preparing agricultural managers and providing education which complies the employers' demands is a priority for the country. Besides the general troublesome issues of the country related to low stock of infrastructure capital, demand rate, above mid-level of sectorial feasibility, there is also insufficient supply of skilled labor. By means of such study program, the shortage of professional and managerial staff in the sectors related to agrarian branch can be filled up.

The graduates of the program can occupy managerial positions in agricultural companies, provide business consultancy, plan and implement agricultural projects and joint enterprises, evaluate the results, conduct sales consultation in the national and international agricultural sectors, take activities in the market and price reporting agencies, accounting companies, tax agencies, banks and insurance companies, as well as conduct production and sales consultation. The graduates will be able to complete professional managerial tasks in agro-industrial companies, to efficiently organize and implement state support programs, to develop and implement agricultural policy programs and to collaborate with foreign institutions. They can take up managerial positions in international organizations, professional associations, cooperatives, community organizations, rural youth organizations, as well as implement scientific research programs and to evaluate the research activities in the agricultural sector.

“Agricultural Management” (M.Sc.) programme not only provides graduates with sustainable knowledge, forms the required skills and competences in the labor market, but it also educates them as individuals who will be able to take responsibilities and make decisions in unexpected and complicated situations.

Graduates can take part in the comprehensive training in the spheres of applied agricultural economics and agricultural management. They also have experience in the projects and teamwork and acquire presentation skills, sales and negotiation techniques as well as computer skills. They can prepare business plans and act as a management consultants.

Most of the master's degree former graduates successfully work in the different spheres of business and agriculture.

The program starts every academic year in autumn (October 1) and is composed of three theory-based semesters and a 6-month internship semester. The duration of the first and second terms is 15 weeks, the internship semester lasts 24 weeks and the 4th final term lasts 10

weeks. The examination period is 1-4 weeks per semesters, at the end of each theory-based semester. The students' work load is 30 ECTS credits per semester. After the first theory-based term, a 24-week scientific and production internship follows and after the third theory-based term the 4-week pre-graduate internship starts, which helps the students write their master's theses.

5.2 Assessment

The study programme is in line with the University's mission and vision, as well as with the goals of the 2020-2024 strategic plan, particularly with the first 3 objectives of education, research and management.

The content of the educational program has a clear structure; the educational components included in the educational program make up a logical interconnected system and collectively allow the achievement of stated goals and program learning outcomes.

The content of the educational programme corresponds to the subject area of the subject area "Management" of the Master's level of the university. In particular, the ability to solve complex tasks, which fully corresponds to the standard of higher education in the field of knowledge "Management and Administration", is the integral feature of the educational programme. The structure of the educational program provides an opportunity for the formation of an individual educational trajectory, in particular through the individual choice of academic disciplines by students of higher education to the extent provided by legislation.

The educational program and curriculum provide for the practical training of higher education students, which allows them to acquire the competencies necessary for further professional activity.

The scope of the educational program and individual educational components (in credits of the European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System) realistically reflects the actual workload of applicants, is appropriate for achieving the goals and programmatic results of education.

The right to freely choose educational components and form an individual trajectory is provided for by the educational program and regulated by relevant regulatory acts. Students studying in the educational program can individually choose the bases of practice and the topic of the master's thesis. The educational program provides practical training and allows you to acquire the competencies necessary for further professional activity.

Students' English language skills should be improved. Higher entrance requirements should be created with regard to English skills or students should be offered compulsory language courses to improve their English language skills.

Within the framework of the further development of the curriculum, current topics such as big data and digitalisation should be given greater consideration.

5.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

6 ESG Standard 1.3: Student-centred learning, teaching, and assessment

Institutions should ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process, and that the assessment of students reflects this approach

6.1 Implementation

The ANAU strategic plan of 2020-2024 has defined following objective “1.5. Introduction and further improvement of student-centered approaches in the educational process organization”. Regarding the afore stated, a reliable, outcome-based and student-centered (1.5.1) assessment system is introduced in the university; teaching and learning methods undergo changes, student-centered, inclusive and smart educational approaches are actively being implemented (1.5.2).”

In the master’s program “Agricultural Management” all possible student-centered approaches are following teaching methods are applied: interactive lectures, practical lessons, laboratory works, seminars, group and individual works, hybrid teaching, teaching via tutors and students, etc.

Teaching and learning methods are selected in line with the stated goals of the course and learning outcomes. Related to the learning outcomes and subject characteristics, lectures, questions and answers, conversation and discussion are mostly used forms of teaching. Teaching and learning methods are diverse and by their nature they promote the development of required competences in students. The following methods can be applied: interactive lectures, role games, lego methodology /comprehension abilities, responsiveness/, video classes /materials from Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences/, mapping agrarian policy on the cork board, MOOC (Massive Online Open Courses)⁴, poster events.

During their study period all students prepare research work and results are presented and discussed during the seminars. Project work and case studies are an important part of the curriculum,. Usually, group work is assigned to solve specific problems found out during the internship and the developed solutions of the problems are introduced and discussed with the stakeholders (such as company representatives where students took an internship) and external specialists. During their internship students collect data in the company for their master’s thesis. During the defense of the thesis students can propose their suggestions to the potential

employers (mostly the employers who manage the farms where the students collected the data are invited).

Students use the MOODLE learning platform, which was introduced in 2017 and since 2018 it has been widely applied in the university.

To support students' learning process, along with the regular lessons, seminars with the participation of mentors and lecturers from Weißenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences, Germany, are offered, a one-month study tour within the frame of the given subject to the Armenian and one-week study tour to the German institution (in case of financial support by DAAD) are organized. During these tours students get opportunity to closely get acquainted with the activities of the given organization, to make comparisons between the Armenian and German economies, learn and collect the data, which they later use in making calculations during their practical classes. During the visits cultural tours are organized.

Exercises are integrated nearly in every module, where participants generally work with their own computers and solve the problems using the methods learned. The lecturers are present during the lessons and lead and support the students. Depending on the question, groups of different sizes are created for the exercises.

Students take a 6-month scientific-production internship (on the basis of the working semester internship) and a 4-week pre-graduate internship in order to learn more about the labor market and conditions.

Throughout the learning process the following aspects are emphasized:

- Accomplishing students' practical program activities in the production branches of the Armenian and German leading farm enterprises,
- Improving university-production cooperation through the development of foreign relations and consultation services creating a sound background for the students to find their position in the labor market,
- Conducting master's study program in Armenian, English and German languages in line with international educational standards and promoting mobility,
- Implementing trainings with the participation of tutors and mentors from Weißenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences, Germany,
- Organizing distance learning consistent with international standards,
- Delivering block courses, if required,
- Applying European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System.

The student optionally can take an 6-month internship in the Armenian or German organizations/institutions. The student can take an internship at the Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences, Germany either immediately after completing the bachelor study program or after starting the program of “Agricultural Management” in the second term as specified in curriculum. Organization of a long-range internship both in the German and Armenian farms not only facilitates the students’ involvement in the labour market, but also provides them with personal and social skills for an independent life.

The student can take an internship as planned by curriculum at the Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences after completion of any semester. If for some reasons the student fails to pass an internship in due time, he/she can take exams in both optional subjects in the third term to complete the 5 credits of his/her internship. The same is anticipated for the ANAU Master’s Program of “Agricultural Management”: to get double diploma the student should submit the credits of the mentioned 2 subjects from the Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences.

In case a student fails exams during the study at the Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences, a student is given two opportunities to retake the failed exams within 2 weeks after returning to Armenia and to continue his/her study at the home university. In case of having debts of up to 12 credits, it is allowed to transfer them into the next semester and to organize the second retake of the failed courses on a paid basis.

The learning process is mainly organized in German language; individual courses can be held in Armenian and English languages.

The university has a “Regulation on Students’ Knowledge Testing and Evaluation” which is available on the website. The regulation also includes an appeal procedure, but no such case has been recorded so far.

Students are informed in advance about the assessment system. At the start of the course each lecturer presents a methodical package with detailed information to the students.

The examination system is regulated particularly within the framework of examination regulation of the university and “Agricultural Management” curriculum. All exams are completed in a written form. The duration of the exam is 90-120 minutes depending on the number of ECTS credits of the module. In order to participate in the exams, students must fulfil the pre-conditions defined for the mandatory subjects.

Students in their 4th semester write master’s thesis in German language. It is defended in front of the state examination committee in Armenian. The topic of the master’s thesis is confirmed in the first year during the chair’s session and afterwards in faculty scientific council and then by the order of the rector. The topic is chosen by giving priority to its modernity and innovation.

As already mentioned, the thesis is written based on the example of Armenian farms. Its structure and design need to correspond to the requirements for the master's thesis defined in "Agricultural Management" study program by Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences confirmed on 16.02.2018 during the ANAU Masters scientific methodical council's session.

The assessment procedure is addressed in the descriptions of the study programs, as well as in the subject and internship programs. Students are offered to take a mock exam in the course units of Agrarian Economics and Business Management at the second half of the first theory-based semester, where the students have an opportunity to evaluate their achievements in the created exam situation and through the received grades they get insight into the level of their knowledge and activities. As a rule, the average points of the mentioned mock exams are low, but it promotes the development of students' study process and pre-exam trainings.

Courses have flexible schedule, which allows a certain group of students to determine the suitable time and schedule. Students can independently complete their assignments after classes in the provided classrooms.

Cultural events also highly promote the creation of student-centered environment.

6.2 Assessment

Overall, it can be stated that the teaching methods used promote student-centred learning and are sufficiently diverse. The teaching and learning forms are therefore rated as very good by the evaluators. The students provide information about a very good supervision relationship with the teaching staff. The students are very satisfied with the supervision and emphasised the excellent support and accessibility of the teaching staff. The study advisors advise students on the choice of study programme and the creation of an individual study plan.

Students are continuously supported by the teaching staff in preparing for exams. The examination regulations are also transparent.

All documents relevant to the study programme are available in the university information system.

All information on the study programme is complete and transparent. Interactive teaching methods encourage students to take an active role in the learning process.

Students receive questionnaires to evaluate their courses and the overall learning experience. Discussing the feedback from these surveys with students can be an additional valuable tool in the student-centred quality process. Students can use office hours and the various electronic communication tools to submit complaints or suggestions for improvement.

Students also have various options available for complaints about assessment.

Students are assessed through various methods, e.g. written and oral examinations, presentations and written assignments. The assessment corresponds to the intended learning outcomes. The assessment procedure and regulations are clear to students and are published at the beginning of each course.

Quality control of study preparation takes place throughout the study period and consists of sufficient different control measures:

The University provides equal opportunities for students in all fields of study, regardless of gender, nationality, religion and social status, language and mode of instruction, as well as taking into account special educational needs and individual opportunities to design an individual educational programme aimed at developing the student's professional competence and cognitive activity.

Thus, the documents and materials provided by the university indicate that the university has developed an effective system of knowledge control. It can be concluded that the university applies the principle of student-centred learning, which aims at the personal development of students and ensures equal opportunities for all groups of students.

The examination system is adequately organised. The information about the examination modalities (e.g. registration and deregistration, type of examination, etc.) is communicated to the students in good time. Students take positive note of the good distribution of examinations in terms of time, which indicates efficient examination organisation. The examination load and the examination density are described as positive by the students. The examination regulations are in place. The examinations are designed in such a way that they correspond to the learning objectives. The examination formats used in the degree programmes enable a good and fair examination of the different areas of knowledge. Overall, sufficient different examination formats are used that adequately cover the different competences and skills. The examination load and acceptance of the examination formats is also based here on the good communication culture and the close supervisory relationship between teachers and students.

The students confirmed the good balance between the different types of examinations as well as an adequate workload. In case of problems with the examination system, students can contact the lecturers or give feedback online. The examination system is organised appropriately. The information about the examination modalities (e.g. date/registration, type of examination, etc.) is communicated to the students in good time. Students also confirmed that there is a balance between the different types of examinations and that the examination load is considered manageable. In the event of problems in the examination system, students can contact the lecturers directly or provide feedback via the evaluations. The examination load and the

acceptance of the forms of examination are also based here, in addition to the formal evaluations, on the good communication culture and the close supervisory relationship between lecturers and students.

The planning of the study programme enables a reliable course of study for the students. The students particularly praise the communication with the lecturers. The students feel well advised. There is a high level of student satisfaction with their studies. The individual supervision, advice and support provided to students certainly contributes to this. Overall, there are sufficient resources available for individual supervision, advice and support for students.

6.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

7 ESG Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition, and certification

Institutions should consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student “life cycle”, e.g. student admission, progression, recognition and certification.

7.1 Implementation

The admission process to Armenian Higher Education Institutions is regulated by the procedures developed by the state. Based on the legislation of the Republic of Armenia law, the “Regulation of master’s degree admission and learning in Higher Education Institutions of Republic of Armenia” has confirmed “Master’s admission Regulation of ANAU foundation”. The regulations apply also to the study program “Agricultural Management”.

The university provides detailed information about the admission to the master’s program on its webpage.

The following admissions criteria are defined for the study program “Agricultural Management”:

- Bachelor’s degree graduates of all ANAU specialties,
- Bachelor’s degree graduates from other universities with high grades of similar majors
- Graduates from ANAU or other universities with related specialties who are certified specialists or have master’s diploma
- foreign citizens

ANAU determines tuition fee of the program.

The Bachelor’s degree graduates of that year participate in the program admission with or without tuition fee based on the GPAs of their previous year. ANAU former graduates, other

applicants including foreign citizens apply for an admission with tuition fees based on their GPAs of their previous studies.

The students of the program are subjected to the provisions of the current regulation of rotation of students. Regardless of whether the student studies in Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences or in ANAU at that moment, he/she is considered as a full-time ANAU student.

In order to apply to the study program, the applicant should at least have A2 level of German language proficiency. German language preparatory courses are organized with DAAD co-financing. Students with even no German knowledge can be involved in the courses. Later on, the German language courses continue in parallel with the classes until the student reaches at least B1 level. The program coordinator introduces the rules and regulations to the students in the groups as well as to those admitted to the master's program, he/she regularly organizes meetings and in addition there are Facebook groups which help students receive answers to their questions.

Other supplementary activities are implemented such as practice exams, involvement of tutors, and preparation for exams.

A university management system, EbuH, was implemented in order to automatize the educational process management which gives opportunity to the professorial and administrative staff to monitor and generate any kind of information about the students' progress, attendances, examination periods, etc.

If all exams are passed successfully, the graduates:

- who have studied two semesters at Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences and two semesters at ANAU receive double diploma containing ANAU master's academic degree and master of sciences qualification by Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences,
- who have studied one semester at Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences and the remaining semesters at ANAU receive either double diploma or ANAU state sample diploma and a certificate of Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences by the decision of the committee,
- who completed the entire study program at ANAU, will receive ANAU state sample diploma and a certificate of Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences,
- who completed the entire study program at Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences will receive Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences diploma.

After successfully completing the program, the graduate receives a master's qualification in Economics.

Since 2001 92 students studied this study program in Armenian language and 91 in German language.

7.2 Assessment

The study requirements are clearly defined and can also be viewed by applicants across parents on the university's website. The website in question is easy to find and very clearly laid out. The university has a suitable procedure for recording relevant information on the course of studies and taking action if necessary. The review panel assesses the admission procedure as transparently described and well thought-out. At the beginning of their studies, students are sufficiently informed about the course of their studies and all opportunities to participate in university life. Upon completion of their studies, graduates therefore receive meaningful and transparent documents showing the qualifications and learning outcomes acquired. In addition, the university has sufficient procedures in place to collect information on students' progress.

Admission requirements are clearly defined. Admission in relation to the need for teachers ensures that there is no oversupply of trained teachers. In addition to the regular admission procedure, the university supports disabled students and students from national minorities.

The university monitors the development of students during their studies. An important element of student success is the sharing of information about the structure of the study programme, prerequisites for course selection, course objectives, course assignments, examinations, workload, etc. In the department, a compulsory introductory course is offered to all students, which introduces them to all the above-mentioned areas. In addition, students receive information from various counselling services throughout their stay at the university.

The degree certificates issued by the university enable students to either continue their education at institutions outside the country or to pursue a professional career abroad.

Overall, it can be said that the university has transparent enrolment procedures, records and monitors the development of students and issues sufficiently meaningful graduation certificates that demonstrate the qualifications acquired in the programme.

7.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

8 ESG Standard 1.5: Teaching staff

Institutions should assure themselves of the competence of their teachers. They should apply fair and transparent processes for the recruitment and development of the staff

8.1 Implementation

The university has established “Regulation of recruitment procedures for academic staff” which defines academic staff categories, their descriptions, procedures of academic staff selection and a competition for recruiting vacant positions. The regulation is publicly available on the website.

The study program “Agricultural Management” (M.Sc.) has additional requirements besides the ones mentioned above: the lecturer must have a good command of German, and must be a graduate of that study program or be a lecturer at the Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences. Some subjects are taught by qualified lecturers with practical experience who are selected by the faculty in order to deliver specific professional knowledge.

Annual professional trainings are organized for the lecturers and staff within the frameworks of the program in Germany and in universities of other cooperating countries. In average two lecturers are trained annually.

Student’s opinion is taken into account in case of the lecturer teaching in Armenian. There were cases when the students complained about the way of teaching which was a reason to change the lecturer. The pool of German speaking lecturers is limited and this approach is not applied.

In order to enhance the research work of academic staff, the university has established “Order of accounting and paying subsidy encouraging scientific activity of ANAU academic staff”. According to the order, high bonuses are given for international licenses, winning scientific-research grants (especially international) and publishing articles in scientific journals with an impact factor (Web of Science, Scopus and so on). Most lecturers in the study program “Agricultural Management” work in applied field with high salaries and are not actively involved in the research. However, due to continuous trainings in Germany they implement the latest findings and advanced technologies in the process of teaching.

8.2 Assessment

The academic and professional qualifications of the teachers involved in the implementation of the educational program ensure the achievement of the goals and program learning outcomes defined by the respective program.

Procedures for the competitive selection of teachers are transparent and allow to ensure the necessary level of their professionalism for the successful implementation of the educational program.

The procedure of competitive selection for the positions of scientific and pedagogical workers at the University is regulated by the relevant Regulations and determines the main requirements and procedures of competitive selection.

The announcement of the competition is posted on the University's website in accordance with the legislation. When evaluating candidates during the competitive selection of teachers, academic and professional qualifications are taken into account in accordance with the goals of the educational program and professional activity. The level of proficiency in the state language, foreign languages, the presence of an academic title, a scientific degree in the specialty of teaching disciplines is taken into account; availability of scientific publications, including in Scopus, WoS, textbooks, manuals, methodological developments, participation in international projects, internships, experience of teaching and practical work, participation in grant projects and research topics, etc.

The institution of higher education promotes the professional development of teachers through its own programs or in cooperation with other organizations.

The university, together with its partners, provides various forms of professional development of teachers.

Teachers improve their professional qualifications and teaching skills mostly through participation in projects, internships, trainings, etc.

The institution of higher education attracts practicing professionals, industry experts, and representatives of employers to classroom classes.

All teachers of the program improve their professional qualifications on an ongoing basis in the areas of the disciplines they teach. Teachers undergo internships, courses to improve pedagogical skills. The best practices are the academic mobility of teachers, both international and national, to participate in conferences, forums, and seminars. Active academic and professional activity contributes to the internationalization of the educational program and the University. The competitive selection procedure is transparent, takes into account teachers' professionalism, experience, and pedagogical skills.

Professional teaching is assured. Applicant selection and staff development are clearly regulated and meet all standards. There is no doubt about the academic qualifications of the teaching staff. The numerical ratio of teachers to students is very good, which is also appreciated by the students. In the discussions with lecturers and students, the impression was confirmed that the staff is very good, both quantitatively and qualitatively. The students confirmed very good supervision by the lecturers. All lecturers are very well qualified. They describe the situation in class and the contact with the lecturers as extremely pleasant and motivating. Yet, the

English language skills of teaching and administrative staff should be improved and corresponding further training courses implemented.

It is recommended to ensure the teaching of professional disciplines by a specialist with appropriate qualifications, which is confirmed by the relevant education and the presence of at least five publications in the field of teaching in professional publications, or work experience in this field.

The same standards and uniform application procedures for teaching staff should be prevailed at all partner universities.

Professional practice representatives should be consulted in an institutionalised way in curriculum development.

8.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

9 ESG Standard 1.6: Learning resources and student support

Institutions should have appropriate funding for learning and teaching activities and ensure that adequate and readily accessible learning resources and student support are provided.

9.1 Implementation

The office for the staff and two auditoriums are allocated specifically for this study program. Nevertheless, all university auditoriums, classrooms and information technologies with their equipment as well as laboratories and other equipment are generally available for the program. All auditoriums and seminar rooms are equipped with whiteboards and some of them with fixed projector, computers and speakers and have an internet connection.

There is a library in ANAU, e-library and reading room: the library has books, e-books and journals. Computers in the library are available for students and lecturers during the whole period of learning. ANAU library provide services online using KOHA system: The library is open during the working days from 9.00-17.00, but some open space reading rooms are open till 21:00.

Master's students are provided with German language professional literature and German teaching books by the study program managing staff. Besides, there are auditoriums where the students can stay and study until late night.

The program is financed by students' tuition fees as well as by DAAD organization.

Management and administration of academic training is implemented by the coordinator of the study program “Agricultural Management”, dean of the Agrobusiness and economics faculty, ANAU vice-rector of international relations and educational reforms. The dean of Agrobusiness and economics faculty presents the data about the study program to ANAU scientific council and is responsible for the solution of the emerged problems.

9.2 Assessment

The ratio between the number of students and the teaching materials and spaces is appropriate. Libraries and classrooms are well digitised and it should be mentioned which has a positive effect on the development process of student-centred learning. Therefore, the premises and equipment are adequate to support the effective implementation of the programme objectives and learning success in all respects.

From the meeting with the student council and the self-evaluation report, it can be concluded that the information provided to the students about the service facilities of the university is very good.

The resource facilities of the study programme can be described as very good. The modern and excellent equipment, which corresponds to the subject standards, is suitable for providing students with a sound education. In the opinion of the review panel, the overall resource endowment is thus very well suited for the implementation of the degree programme. Buildings, rooms and technical equipment can be described as exemplary. The library offers students extensive support in searching for information and using the available technology. The university is also well equipped for digital teaching.

The needs of a heterogeneous student body are also adequately addressed. Internal quality assurance takes material resources into account in its evaluation culture and regularly solicits feedback from students. The evaluation team assesses all material, financial and human resources as fully sufficient to achieve the qualification goals of the study programme. The needs of a heterogeneous student body are taken into account in every respect.

For the administrative staff, there is the possibility of individual further development. The scope and qualifications of the non-academic administrative staff can be described as very good. Sufficient opportunities for further training are available.

It can be stated that the degree programme has a high degree of studyability. Yet, the University of Applied Science Weihenstephan-Triesdorf should establish a good administrative infrastructure for all partner universities and create even more support services in general and during student mobility phases with a view to even better studyability.

In order to guarantee the implementation of the study programme, the staff should also grow with the increasing number of students.

9.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

10 ESG Standard 1.7: Information management

Institutions should ensure that they collect, analyse and use relevant information for the effective management of their programmes and other activities.

10.1 Implementation

ANAU has developed Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) for study program which allow to follow the implementation of study program, to evaluate the success and failures. KPIs include the number of students, the number of graduates working in the field of their studies, the amount of their average salaries, number of international students, the number of certified educational programs (including those recognized by internationally certified agencies), the number of educational programs in foreign language and so on. KPIs relate to every sphere of activity of the university: management, finances, science, infrastructures and human resources. All the data is collected by quality assessment and assurance center which regularly presents reports to the decision-making bodies of the university.

The data on students' progress and their achievements are presented to the faculty council each semester. Ebuh system gives opportunity to continuously check and evaluate the presented information. The number of the students in the study program is small, which gives opportunity to follow their progress on a frequent basis. Each lecturer evaluates the efficiency of the teaching. The warm atmosphere created among the students and teachers gives opportunity to openly speak about problems and challenges and to evaluate the achievements.

Career Development and Lifelong Learning Division of the university follows the achievements of the graduates. The Agrarian Management team is able to follow the career path of the alumni and regularly collects information.

All the information related to the study program is presented in the faculty scientific council and then in the scientific council of the university. The following information is reflected in the reports: student admissions data, improvement of resources, graduates' achievements, data on the student and academic staff mobility.

Information about the study program is posted on the university website. All undergraduate students of all specialties receive information about the international master's program through

special meetings during which the coordinator makes presentations. They keep informed about the German preparatory courses. The announcements about German language courses are posted on university website and university Facebook page twice per year.

Study program managing team collects data on the study program master's students, their gender and age and place of residence.

ANAU "Agricultural Management" (M.Sc.) study programme coordinator regularly receives information about ANAU master's students studying in Germany and follows their progress. If necessary, the coordinator takes actions to help the master's student to return to studies in the corresponding semester after quitting the studies in Germany and returning to Armenia.

A new mechanism was implemented within the framework of "Agricultural Management" (M.Sc.) study programme which is called "graduate to the applicant" that gives opportunity to the applicant to receive information from program graduate, to understand program advantages and strengths, to get informed about the possible risks.

10.2 Assessment

The university has a well-functioning information management system. The administration has thorough data collection systems. The current and complete data structure is used very well for the internal quality management system. The evaluation of the data is accompanied by quality assurance measures and planning of follow-up activities.

The programme uses the existing infrastructure of the university to collect student feedback on individual courses and lectures as well as on the environment at the university in general. Students report that they feel encouraged to give feedback to lecturers and that their feedback is well received by lecturers. A survey of student satisfaction with the quality and conditions of the study programme is conducted annually to investigate student opinion on the quality of the University's educational and administrative services.

For the programme that is in the process of being accredited, there is sufficient information to attract applicants.

The university has the necessary procedures for collecting and analysing information about the programme, including key performance indicators, information about the student body, the level of academic achievement, student performance and examinations. Students are provided with educational resources and student support services.

The expert group therefore notes that the university regularly collects and analyses information on the study programme, students, graduates and other activities as part of the quality management system and makes it available to the internal quality assurance system.

Both students and teachers are involved in the processes through a procedure and existing structures at the university. In addition, graduates and employers are also involved in the process.

Thus, as part of the university's quality management, data on students is collected and their assessment is carried out. Also based on the self-evaluation report of the university and the discussions during the online evaluation, the expert group was able to confirm that the institution implements the necessary measures to assess the quality of teaching.

Information management includes the use of various methods to provide information. Confidentiality of information is also guaranteed.

10.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

11 ESG Standard 1.8: Public information

Institutions should publish information about their activities, including programmes, which is clear, accurate, objective, up-to date and readily accessible.

11.1 Implementation

Information about the 'Agrarian Management' (M.Sc.) master's program is available on the ANAU home page.

Information and consultation on the study program "Agricultural Management" (M.Sc.) is provided by program coordinator and teaching staff. Consultation meetings can be organized individually by phone. Coordinator and staff of the master's program organize informative events and report on cooperation with the Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences and possibilities of exchange.

The changes in schedule and other changes are presented to the master's students on time on the announcement board. Overview of the modules is sent to the master's student by email and if they wish module manuals are sent as well. The materials are available in German and partially in Armenian languages. Master's students of ANAU can use the modules and videos posted on the MOODLE platform of Agricultural Management program of Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences.

Since 2019 the program runs its own Facebook page.

11.2 Assessment

The main source of public information about the study program “Agricultural Management” (M.Sc.) is the official website of the university, the website of the Faculty of Agricultural Economics, the website of the Faculty of Agrobusiness and Management, and website of the Master’s Center which is the graduation department for this study program.

All persons interested in receiving information about events at the university and, in particular, information updates on program have informational support through close communication using various social networks: Facebook, Instagram. The Master’s Preparing Center additionally highlights all information related to the program on its official Facebook page. Considerable attention is paid to the coverage of all events related to the organization of the educational process, the life of students and graduates. The university has its own YouTube channel, where all scientific and educational events of the university are covered and students upload videos. Students can find here the information about the history of successful partnership, advantages of studying the master’s program etc.

The university offers detailed information on studying and teaching as well as on the university’s main research areas. Organisational documents and relevant regulations are made available on the website. Contact persons and contact points for the degree programme and student life are clearly and transparently named.

The information provided to the public about the degree programme is satisfactory overall. There are many opportunities for prospective students to find out about the university and student life.

Information about study programmes is publicly available (admission criteria, learning outcomes, qualifications awarded, information about employment of graduates, etc.). Information about the study programme that is in line with the university’s mission is secured. High school graduates, students, graduates and other interested groups can find out about the university’s activities and offers on its homepage. In addition, contact persons are named for further information and questions. Yet there should be better strategic communication activities developed to publicise the study offer in order to arouse the interest of potential applicants in the long term.

The university provides information about its activities, such as the degree programme and the selection criteria for admission, the intended learning outcomes of the degree programmes, the teaching, learning and examination methods, the student success rates and the qualifications of the teaching staff.

In addition, the university provides information on its homepage about its academic achievements, such as publications, external and internal conferences and events, as well as non-academic achievements, such as cultural and social projects and activities.

The study-related documents and information are to be accessible to both students and prospective students. In addition, contact persons are named for further information and questions.

The university provides information about its activities. The University conducts its activities based on the principles of transparency, openness, involvement and awareness-raising of all stakeholders in educational activities: One of the main means of providing information is through the use of information technology and media. In addition to the information on the University's website, the public and applicants are provided with information on the specifics of the study programme under accreditation through events such as the Open Day.

11.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

12 ESG Standard 1.9: On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes

Institutions should monitor and periodically review their programmes to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of students and society. These reviews should lead to continuous improvement of the programme. Any action planned or taken as a result should be communicated to all those concerned.

12.1 Implementation

The system of quality assurance implemented in the university allows to adjust to the changes in the market in a flexible way, to monitor, assess and update existing study program. All managing staff of the study program are obliged to benchmark with foreign universities, to meet employers, to discuss their needs and to reflect the received information with regards to the aims and outcomes of the study program.

Since the study program “Agricultural Management” was developed a result of an agreement signed between ANAU and Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences, it is compared with the study program of the latter. The coordinator of the study program has created a comparison matrix with the program of Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences. Training, its design and didactic preparation aspects are intensively discussed with directors and professors of partner universities during annual conferences. These kinds of meeting were particularly used during the design and improvement of the program. The program underwent changes during time, it was in Armenian language, then became bilingual, German language was added and now it has become a German language program. If the students

were selected based on other principles in the beginning, particularly only the students of Agrarian Management were admitted to Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences, since 2020 ANAU bachelor's graduates in their final year who knew German language and have motivation could also be admitted.

All this gives opportunity to follow to international trends, to update teaching and assessment methods and to satisfy the needs of the master's students who have applied for this program. Lecturers regularly update their learning materials as a result of their professional trainings in Germany. The students participate in the assessment of the lectures.

The coordinator of the study programme "Agricultural Management"(M.Sc.) in Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences assessed the programme. A residual review was done concerning student's knowledge by the examination assignments which was sent by Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences and the results were assessed. It gave opportunity not only to assess the assessment mechanisms existing in the study program but also to indirectly assess teaching and programme efficiency.

The meetings and exchange of information, discussing difficulties and challenges, suggestions regarding the solutions and the provision of support take place regularly with partner universities of Weihenstephan-Triesdorf University of Applied Sciences.

12.2 Assessment

The Examination of the regulatory documents in the Academic Policy section of the University's website, the self-evaluation report, the results of the faculty and student survey, and the results of the online survey confirmed that monitoring and regular evaluation of the study program "Agricultural Management"(M.Sc.) is carried out at the University.

The schedule of activities for monitoring the quality of education was approved, according to which the University monitors and regularly evaluates the study programmes in order to achieve the objectives and meet the needs of students and society. In order to determine the level of satisfaction of internal needs, the University organises and conducts a survey among students, faculty and University staff every academic session.

The survey is conducted to determine the level of satisfaction with the students' educational needs, their attitude towards the educational process, the socio-cultural environment, etc.

The results of the survey are statistically analysed, discussed in the administrative meetings and taken into account in the further planning of educational activities. According to the monitoring statistics, the programme management analyses and compiles the survey results in order to initiate the necessary measures to achieve the desired results.

The existing quality management seems to function according to a hierarchical principle. However, the goal is a functioning control circle between the participants in order to improve the quality of research and teaching (Circle of Quality). This Circle of Quality functions according to the bottom up - top down principle.

The university regularly reviews the strategy and policy in the area of quality and monitors its implementation.

Overall, it should be noted that responsibilities are clearly and comprehensibly regulated, not least because the core processes of quality assurance are documented in the university's regulations.

Feedback between students and teachers is a prerequisite for improving teaching and should be introduced. The evaluation results of the anonymous course evaluations will be presented to the students after the surveys and discussed with them in order to derive concrete measures for improving teaching.

It became clear in the discussions that there is definitely close contact with the graduates and that they are surveyed very soon after graduation.

The course evaluations thus serve the continuous development and improvement of quality and studyability. The student workload is continuously surveyed in the course evaluations; corresponding questions are included in the questionnaires. An evaluation of the workload through a module should take place at regular intervals.

Students are made aware of the student workload and examination requirements by the lecturers at the beginning of the course. In the degree programme, the measure of how many hours one ECTS point corresponds to the student workload is anchored in the regulatory documents.

With regard to the quality of teaching, it should be noted that measures to ensure it begin with the recruitment of teaching staff. In addition, the university offers teaching staff various further training opportunities, both on technical and didactic topics.

It can be stated that there is a combination of internal and external quality management in order to offer its own study programmes in a generally ESG-compliant manner.

The study programme "Agricultural Management"(M.Sc.) is regularly evaluated to ensure quality and to check compliance with the high quality standards. Ongoing monitoring of the study programme is carried out in accordance with the quality assurance policy. The programme is reviewed regularly and if changes are required, they are made. This process is exemplary. The study programmes thus have suitable and different procedures for internal quality assurance.

The university has a systematic procedure of analysis, development, monitoring and periodic revision of the educational program. Employers who confirmed this process as transparent, understandable and accessible are involved in the improvement of the educational program. A culture of quality has been formed in the academic community of the University, which contributes to the continuous development of the educational program and educational activities under this program.

The process of collecting proposals from various groups of stakeholders is insufficiently organized. It is recommended to strengthen work on the organization of the process of collecting proposals from various groups of stakeholders.

It is recommended to carry out further development of the internal quality assurance system by timely response to legislative changes, and by improving the coordination of measures to monitor the quality of the educational program and educational activities at the University level.

Standardised evaluation procedures should be introduced, in order to advance the quality assurance of the study programme and, if necessary, to be able to derive recommendations for action.

12.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

13 ESG Standard 1.10: Cyclical external quality assurance

Institutions should undergo external quality assurance in line with the ESG on a cyclical basis

13.1 Implementation

National framework of quality assurance in the Republic of Armenia is introduced by two levels:

Institutional accreditation, which is mandatory and is a cyclical repeating process

- Program accreditation which so far was done on a voluntary basis
- Institutional accreditation is a required precondition for the program accreditation.

The process is regulated by the Government of Armenia by the following decisions: Order of institutional and program accreditation and Standards and criteria of institutional and program accreditation.

Following the existing order, ANAU has twice received institutional accreditation and was accredited by RA ANQA. The results of the accreditation are presented in state register in Armenian and English languages.

After the first accreditation, strategic management system was embedded in the university, the internal system of quality assurance completed the embedding process and entered the stage of development. Second accreditation served as stimulus for the improvement of study programs. The university intends to create an internal quality managing network system and gradually make a transition to the complete system of quality management.

Program accreditation by the state accrediting body ANQA has not been implemented yet. Agricultural Management academic program has received temporary accreditation in 2016 by ACQUIN, fixed the defects in a defined period and was accredited in 2018. According to the remark made after a temporary accreditation in order to ensure the high level of the master's theses a guide was made for the students where minimal requirements and standards were defined for them. After that the requirements towards the theses increased, the topics became more market-driven, new mechanism was embedded where the managers of those farms where the master's students collected the data for their theses were present during the defense of the thesis. The offers for farm improvement sometimes interest the employers and give the graduate an opportunity to receive a job.

13.2 Assessment

As far as the legal framework of quality assurance is concerned, the study programme is conducted in accordance with the regulations and guidelines. For this purpose, the university has a combination of internal and external quality management to offer the study programme in accordance with the ESG. The University has undergone institutional accreditation. The accreditation results are incorporated into the structuring of the University's business processes. Of particular importance is the cooperation with external stakeholders such as partner universities, graduates, industry and employers in order to gain impetus for continuous internal quality development.

Quality management ensures very well that the general quality assurance measures and instruments are constantly up-to-date and transparent. The University fulfils all obligatory aspects of external quality assurance: the different organisational units and levels are adequately in place and were explained in detail in the interviews with the HEI. Both internal and external quality assurance of the University's measures take into account all legal requirements and benefit from each other to advance the quality development of the study programme. External quality assurance extends to all necessary organisational levels such as financial operations and educational provision. The internal and external quality assurance mechanisms for the

continuous development of the programme is well developed and the cyclical functioning of the programme's quality assessment is effective. The quality of the surveys and the processing of the results can be rated as very good. No specific problems in the cyclical external quality assurance were reported for the study programme.

The follow-up activities of the university's external quality assurance in preparing the next procedure are generally well thought out. The results of the external assessment and recognition of the quality of the study program (reports, expert opinions, etc.) are published on the university's website.

In conclusion, the coherence between external and internal quality assurances is well structured.

13.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

III Recommendation to the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN

1 **Assessment of compliance the Standards and Guidelines in the Higher European Area (ESG) in the actual official version**

The study programme „**Agricultural Management**” (M.Sc.) was assessed on the basis of the "Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area" (ESG) and the national or other relevant regulations.

The expert group concludes that the **ESG standards** 1.1 (Policy for quality assurance), 1.2 (Design and approval of programmes), 1.3 (Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment), 1.4 (Student admission, progression, recognition and certification), 1.5 (Teaching staff), 1.6 (Learning resources and student support), 1.7 (Information management), 1.8 (Public information), 1.9 (On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes) and 1.10 (Cyclical external quality assurance) are fulfilled.

The assessment criteria are as follows:

Standard 1.1 Policy for quality assurance: Universities have a publicly accessible quality assurance strategy, which is part of their strategic management. This strategy is developed and implemented by internal stakeholder representatives through appropriate structures and processes, involving external stakeholders.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Standard 1.2 Design and approval of programmes: Universities have procedures for the design and approval of their courses. The courses are designed in such a way that their objectives, including the desired learning outcomes, can be achieved. The qualification obtained during a degree program is clearly defined and communicated; it refers to the corresponding level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, the qualifications framework for the European Higher Education Area.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Standard 1.3 Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment: Universities ensure that the courses offered are carried out in such a way as to encourage students to play an active role in the design of the learning process and that this approach is also taken into account when assessing students / examinations.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Standard 1.4 Student admission, progression, recognition and certification: Universities ensure that the courses offered are carried out in such a way as to encourage students to play an active role in the design of the learning process and that this approach is also taken into account when assessing students / examinations.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Standard 1.5 Teaching staff: Universities ensure the competence of their teachers. They use fair and transparent procedures for the recruitment and further training of their employees.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Standard 1.6 Learning resources and student support: The university has adequate funding to finance study and teaching and ensure that there is always a sufficient and readily available range of learning and support available for their studies.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Standard 1.7 Information management: Universities ensure that they collect, analyze and use the relevant data relevant to the successful conduct of studies and other activities.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Standard 1.8 Public information: Universities publish easily understandable, correct, objective, up-to-date and well-accessible information about their activities and courses of study.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Standard 1.9 On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes: Universities are constantly monitoring their courses and regularly reviewing them to ensure that they achieve the goals set and meet the needs of students and society. The tests lead to a continuous improvement of the courses. All affected parties will be informed about any measures planned or resulting from this.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Standard 1.10 Cyclical external quality assurance: Universities regularly undergo external quality assurance procedures in accordance with the ESG.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

The peer-review experts note that the recommendations from the previous accreditation procedure have been adequately taken into account.

2 Accreditation Recommendation

The peer-review experts recommend an unconditional accreditation of the study programme **„Agricultural Management” (M.Sc.)** with the following **recommendations**:

1. Students' English language skills should be improved. Higher entrance requirements should be created with regard to English skills or students should be offered compulsory language courses to improve their English language skills.
2. Within the framework of the further development of the curriculum, current topics such as big data and digitalisation should be given greater consideration.
3. The same standards and uniform application procedures for teaching staff should be prevailed at all partner universities.
4. The English language skills of teaching and administrative staff should be improved and corresponding further training courses implemented.
5. Professional practice representatives should be consulted in an institutionalised way in curriculum development.
6. The HSWT should establish a good administrative infrastructure for all partner universities and create even more support services in general and during student mobility phases with a view to even better studyability.
7. In order to guarantee the implementation of the study programmes, the staff should also grow with the increasing number of students.
8. Better strategic communication activities should be developed to publicise the study offer in order to arouse the interest of potential applicants in the long term.
9. Standardised evaluation procedures should be introduced, in order to advance the quality assurance of the study programme and, if necessary, to be able to derive recommendations for action.
10. It is recommended to carry out further development of the internal quality assurance system by timely response to legislative changes, and by improving the coordination of measures to monitor the quality of the educational programme and educational activities at the University level.

11. The expert group recommends involving students more in the work of the department in order to take their wishes and suggestions more into account when planning and implementing the educational process, selecting, reviewing and updating the educational programme.
12. It is recommended to ensure the teaching of professional disciplines by a specialist with appropriate qualifications.

IV Decisions of the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN

Based on the evaluation report of the expert group and the statements of the Higher Education Institutions the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN makes on the 09 May 2023 the following decisions unanimously:

**The study programme “Agricultural Management” (M.Sc.) at the Armenian National Agrarian University is accredited without any conditions.
The accreditation is valid until 30. September 2029.**

The following recommendations are given for the further development of the study programme:

- Students' English language skills should be improved. Higher entrance requirements should be created with regard to English skills or students should be offered compulsory language courses to improve their English language skills.
- Within the framework of the further development of the curriculum, current topics such as big data and digitalisation should be given greater consideration.
- The same standards and uniform application procedures for teaching staff should be prevailed at all partner universities.
- The English language skills of teaching and administrative staff should be improved and corresponding further training courses implemented.
- Professional practice representatives should be consulted in an institutionalised way in curriculum development.
- The HSWT should establish a good administrative infrastructure for all partner universities and create even more support services in general and during student mobility phases with a view to even better studyability.
- In order to guarantee the implementation of the study programmes, the staff should also grow with the increasing number of students.
- Better strategic communication activities should be developed to publicise the study offer in order to arouse the interest of potential applicants in the long term.
- Standardised evaluation procedures should be introduced, in order to advance the quality assurance of the study programme and, if necessary, to be able to derive recommendations for action.
- It is recommended to carry out further development of the internal quality assurance system by timely response to legislative changes, and by improving the coordination of measures to monitor the quality of the educational programme and educational activities at the University level.
- The expert group recommends involving students more in the work of the department in order to take their wishes and suggestions more into account when planning and implementing the educational process, selecting, reviewing and updating the educational programme.
- It is recommended to ensure the teaching of professional disciplines by a specialist with appropriate qualifications.